

# NEWSLETTER

Cumbria County Council Leader, Eddie Martin, has written an open letter to the Government complaining that windfarms are pushed through despite local opposition. He said:

*"In short, and despite the palliative rhetoric and occasional panaceas, central government is simply not listening. And that is profoundly depressing. And fundamentally undemocratic."*

Alan Sloman's response to the proposed new windfarm on the Black Isle, 26 June 2011

*I am sure the Developers will be offering their usual thirty pieces of silver to betray your heritage. I wonder how many local groups, like Judas, will salve their guilt, take the money and betray their children's heritage?*

Hello everyone.

Like many of you we have been attending the local public meetings on the Wind Energy Interim Planning Policy and very useful they have been, especially for the opportunity they gave to assess the public mood in relation to wind turbines.

There were 60+ people present at Castle Douglas and some 40+ at Wigtown. The meetings were predominantly critical of the onward march of turbine applications and possible approvals and concern was expressed forcibly and angrily at times about the lack of protection offered by the current and proposed new policy.

It is interesting to note that the documents contain some 800+ pages and one is left wondering who could possibly think that this is acceptable in terms of a public consultation.

Am I living on another planet?

**Please see pages 2 & 3 for the key changes we will be seeking.**

For the first time since we began the newsletter there is nothing to say about the Mayfield application but as you have come to expect other applications have into view. 18 new applications were received by Dumfries and Galloway Council since we last communicated ranging from scoping reports for 84 m and 75 m turbines to a plethora of applications which will now await a decision, some single turbines, others in multiples ranging in height from 21m to 75m.

However, the projected application for an estimated **24 turbines of 125m in height at Benshinnie**, east of Loch Ken and close to Parton is concentrating the mind.

Predictably the developer is flagging up the community benefit they aim to pay. (see Lord Greaves comments below and Alan Sloman's words left for alternative opinions of community benefit)



One person's view in Ayrshire

The Wind Turbines (minimum distance from residential premises) Bill received its 2nd reading in the House of Lords on 10 June.

*The Government claim to believe that they will achieve support for their on-shore wind farm policy by encouraging developers to pass on to local communities in one form or another more of the subsidies which they are about to receive. Apart from being unlikely to succeed, this policy is both corrupt and divisive. The people who will receive the advantage will not be the same as those who suffer the injury.*

*How will a community playground, while it may sway a planning committee, compensate someone who has seen his environment immeasurably degraded and the value of his house fall by 35 per cent? Lord Greaves*

*As a result of government intervention, the wind industry is turning into a money-grabbing scam masquerading as an environmental benefit. There is no environmental benefit from wind farms-but it is a money-grabbing scam.*

Lord Willouby de Broke

(Quotes from the debate)

## The Dumfries and Galloway Interim Planning Policy for Wind Energy

### Ideas for your response by 22 July 2011

**In our opinion there are several important issues that have been overlooked in the IPP documentation. Whilst we could itemise a long list of improvements, we have focussed below on the key changes we are seeking. Feel free to use them or not as you think fit in your own response to the consultation. The deadline and address for responses are printed on the next page.**

- 1 Press for a sub-division in the Medium and Small-Medium turbine height bands (or typologies as they are called in the IPP) as follows:
  - Large: Turbines above 80 - 150m in height to blade tip. (as IPP)
  - Medium: Turbines between 50m and 80m in height to blade tip. Lower height band 50-60m; Upper height band 60-80m. (changes to IPP 3.2)
  - Small to Medium: Turbines between 20m and 50m in height to blade tip. Lower height band 20-35m; Upper height band 35-50m. (changes to IPP 3.2)
  - Small: Turbines between 12m and 20m in height to blade tip. (as IPP)

**Reason:** the turbine height bands for small-medium and small turbines are too broad. The use of sub-divisions would provide an extra filter and direct developers to landscape character areas appropriately matched to the scale of their projects. This would provide clarity to developers and avoid inappropriately-scaled and matched applications which waste everyone's time and energy.

- 2 Reduce the numbers of Medium height turbines from groups of below 10 to "a maximum of 5 turbines". (IPP 3.2) This would be particularly appropriate at the transition from the Dundrennan Peninsula to the Coastal Granite Upland and would protect popular viewpoints and tourist routes in both landscape character areas.
- 3 Reduce the number of Small-Medium turbines from groups of below 5 to "a maximum of 3 turbines". (IPP 3.2) The IPP is inconsistent on this quoting 5 at 3.2 and 4.2 and 3 at 4.32.
- 4 Reduce the number of Small turbines from groups of 5 to " a maximum of 3 turbines".

**Reason:** reducing the numbers in each height band would offer greater assurance against inappropriate applications and offer greater protection for landscape character areas.

- 5 State clearly that any application for a community proposed windfarm or turbines will be processed and determined in the same manner as any other wind farm or turbine proposal.

**Reason:** to provide clarity to community groups and give assurance on the integrity of conduct in public matters.

- 6 Specify and list the major tourist routes, cycle routes and walking routes, key monuments and viewpoints, historic buildings and designed gardens, archaeological sites, World Heritage sites and battlefields, etc., and **give greater protection through buffer zones**. Cross link to Environmental Report.

**Reason:** to give unequivocal support and greater protection to the region's special places which in turn are key assets of the region and significant attractions for tourists.

Continued on next page.....

- 7 Provide detailed Development Management Criteria (Appendix A) with specific guidance on the standards to be applied to give some protection to residents, particularly in relation to:

**Setback distance, suggested wording as follows:** the minimum setback distance from any village, settlement or single property shall be no less than 20 times the nearest turbine height to its tip.

**Noise, suggested wording as follows:** properties in the vicinity of wind turbines should not experience noise levels in excess of 35dB(A), as measured outside properties, under all wind conditions and at all times, day and night. In addition, specify expected standards in relation to Amplitude Modulation and Low Frequency Noise to protect the health of residents.

**Shadow flicker, suggested wording as follows:** the minimum setback distance from any village, settlement or single property shall be no less than 20 times the nearest turbine height to its tip.

**Wind speed:** wind speed data, collected over a period of 12 months on site prior to application, should be included within all EIAs as stated in the *Online update* to PAN45 under "Technical Information for Onshore Wind Turbines: Wind Speed." This would confirm that the technology can operate efficiently as per SPP 187.

**Reason:** to protect the health and well-being of residents, provide transparency and ensure integrity in the conduct of public life, all in the public interest.

- 8 Specify in full the Detail and Use of Planning Conditions and the penalties for non-compliance, in addition to the Legal Agreements contained in Development Management Criteria 2.

**Reason:** to assure residents, ensure transparency and protect the public and developers.

- 9 Once the amended IPP has been prepared the document should go out to a further round of consultations and public meetings.

**Reason:** to aid transparency and make clear to the public the resulting affects of the consultation process and to give reasons for inclusion or exclusion of proposals.

- 10 Post all responses to this IPP on the Council's website.

**Reason:** provide transparency and confidence in relation to this whole consultation process.

## THANK YOU

### Responses by 22 July 2011

In writing to:

Development Planning  
Planning & Environment Services  
Dumfries & Galloway Council  
Rae Street  
Dumfries  
DG1 1LW

Email: [LDP@dumgal.gov.uk](mailto:LDP@dumgal.gov.uk)

NB

Please note that there are many more issues that we have identified, e.g. the absence of a glossary of terms, the order of the sieving methodology in the spatial framework, the maps, the absence of the section on community benefit, lack of page numbers, the lack of an executive summary and the 800+ pages for what is supposed to be a public consultation. In our personal responses we shall be taking up some of these issues.

## Nearly everything you need to know about the Feed-in Tariff Scheme

The day has finally come when you have been reduced to reading about the feed-in tariff scheme that is behind the tsunami of wind turbine applications currently invading the planning system. You never thought that such a topic would be of interest, did you? Well, it isn't really the most exciting way to while away your days but it does provide an explanation and following the oft quoted aphorism that "knowledge is power" it might give you the edge in debate. On the other hand you might think that banging your head against a brick wall is preferable. You decide.

The system has been established in law and came into being in the UK in April 2010. It is a scheme whereby those installing turbines, up to a maximum of 5 megawatt, benefit from a fixed income for every kilowatt hour (kWh) of declared capacity of electricity produced. So it supports relatively small scale domestic and commercial developments (not big wind farms, think houses and farms). The scheme has two components from which the owner benefits:

- The generation tariff: fixed income for every kWh of electricity generated and **used in own property**, currently up to 36.2 pence per kWh depending on size;
- The export tariff: an additional fixed income for every kWh generated and **sold back to the grid**, currently 3p per kWh.

**Who pays?** You do. The tariffs are paid to the owner by the energy suppliers who pass on the costs to their customers, including administration costs!

So the owner benefits from reduced bills, a fixed income for the electricity he/she uses and a fixed income for electricity sold. The upshot is that wind turbine neighbours pay for wind turbine owner's benefits. Now, could you have devised a fairer system than that!

Tariff agreements last for 20 years, they are indexed linked to the Retail Price Index and those currently in the scheme enjoy fixed tariffs for the whole period. Future entrants to the scheme may see tariff levels change depending on market conditions, these are reviewed every five years and the next review is in 2013.

Of course the owner must buy and install the turbine but according to the Government, the initial capital cost of installation can expect to earn up to 8% per annum, that is, the expected return is two to three times the capital cost over the duration of the tariff.

Certain other renewable energy systems also may qualify for feed-in tariffs: photovoltaic, hydro, combined heat & power to 2 kW and anaerobic digestion for biogas but they are not all awarded the same tariff level. Wind has the second highest tariff level after photovoltaic.

**N.B. Examination papers will be sent out in two week's time!**

### Grants to farmers

I should mention in relation to renewable energy development, that farmers may apply for a grant of 51% of the costs of purchase and installation of equipment, including construction costs. However, they cannot, with one or two exceptions, have both a grant and benefit from the feed-in tariff scheme.



This is what one resident has to look at daily.

The noise and shadow flicker are a constant strain for this household.

This and the front cover photo were taken by Rae in Ayrshire.

Clearly the result of an empathy bypass.

## Subsidies by any other name

**The market price paid for electricity is inflated by hidden subsidies which impact on household budgets and stifle consumer spending.**

The main policy tool used to promote the renewable energy industry in the UK is the Renewable Obligation (ROC) which effectively raises the market price paid for electricity from renewable sources. It is an indirect subsidy which currently forces energy suppliers to purchase 11% of their electricity from renewable sources at inflated prices and with large fines if they fail. **The costs are passed on to consumers.**

Together with other grants and subsidies in 2009/10, the ROC scheme cost consumers £1.4bn UK wide and in Scotland £168m. (*Worth the Candle*, Verso Economics, March 2011)

In Germany, the renewable energy industry is promoted by feed-in tariffs (not unlike those used in the UK for smaller scale developments, see page 4) In 2009 Germany's feed-in tariffs exceeded the per kWh cost of conventional electricity by 300%. (*Economic Impacts from the promotion of renewable energies: The German experience*, Rheinisch-Westfälisches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung, 2009)

In a nutshell the UK consumer underwrites two schemes, the Renewable Obligation and the Feed-in Tariff. These schemes raise the cost of your energy bills and since the electricity grid needs substantial upgrading it is highly likely the consumers will pay for this too.

The wholesale market price of energy is largely irrelevant to the big six energy companies because they tend to supply their own energy or have long-term deals with power generators. In short, they own the windfarms or have brokered deals.

## Making money the easy way

Electricity from wind turbines earns income in at least two ways:

- 1 The sale of Renewable Obligation Certificates to energy suppliers, currently priced at £51.04 per MWh of generated electricity, and
- 2 The sale of generated electricity to the National Grid, currently selling at £37.19 per MWh.

On this basis a 3MW turbine operating at 30% efficiency will earn:

$$3 \text{ (MW)} \times 24 \text{ (hours)} \times 365 \text{ (days)} \times 30\% = 7884 \text{ MWh}$$

$$\text{Selling the ROCs } 7884 \times £51.04 = £402,399.36$$

$$\text{Selling the electricity } 7884 \times £37.19 = £293,205.96$$

That's a total of £695,605.32 for one turbine for one year that is only 30% efficient.

Over a 20 year lifespan it amounts to about £14 million.

The turbine, installation and maintenance would cost between £3.5 million to £4.5 million. Taking the higher cost, this would take some 6.5 years to recoup leaving 13.5 years earning profit.

**Profit = £9.5 million approx.**

visit: [www.tw312.org.uk](http://www.tw312.org.uk)

## Summary of Turbine numbers projected in planning applications

**37 turbines approved**

**19 masts approved**

**59 turbine applications awaiting a decision**

**30 turbine applications awaiting submission**

**A total of 126 turbines**

## Stewartry planning— turbines and masts Submitted applications awaiting decision

29/06/2011	Holmhead Farm Moniave	11/P/2/0267	1 x 45.7m
29/06/2011	Holmhead Farm Moniave	11/P/2/0265	1 x 45.7m
22/06/2011	Rattra Farm Borgue	11/P/2/0252	1 x 39.9m
10/06/2011	Balmangan Fm Dundrennan	11/P/2/0238	3 x 39.6m
10/06/2011	Muirhead Fm Twynholm	11/P/2/0237	1 x 27m

### Submitted applications awaiting decision

### Submitted applications awaiting decision

Date	Location	Application No	No of turbines/ mast & height	Date	Location	Application No	No of turbines/ mast & height
07/06/2011	Culnaightree Fm Auchencairn	11/P/2/0230 11/P/2/0229	1 x 75m 50m mast	13/04/2010	Bank Farm Kirkcudbright	10/P/2/0142	1 x 45m
31/05/2011	Low Arkland Kelton	11/P/2/0213	2 x 27m	22/01/2010	Milnmark Fm Dalry	10/P/2/0021	5 x 81m 55m mast
31/05/2011	Kelton Hill Fm Castel Douglas	11/P/2/0212	2 x 27m	20/10/2009	Plascow Farm Nr Dalbeattie	09/P/2/0359	3 x 84m
30/05/2011	Ernespie Farm Castle Douglas	11/P/2/0211	1 x 39.6m	05/08/2009	Galtway Hill Milton Fm, Kbt	09/P/2/0267	2 x 100m
19/05/2011	Blairshinnoch Kirkgunzeon	11/P/2/0195	3 x 27.1m	08/01/2007	Barnbackle Fm Lochfoot	07/P/2/0006	2 x 100m
16/05/2011	Ingleston Farm Borgue	11/P/2/0193	2 x 39.6m	<b>Applications awaiting submission</b>			
11/05/2011	Larghill Farm Crocketford	11/P/2/0182	1 x 21m	15/06/2011	Little Sypland Kirkcudbright	11/E/2/0039	1 x 84m
04/05/2011	Garrochar Creetown	11/P/2/0170	2 x 27m	14/06/2011	W Kirkcarswell Dundrennan	11/E/2/0038	1 x 75m
15/04/2011	Shenrick Farm Crocketford	11/P/2/0154	2 x 21m	31/05/2011	Auchenlosh Dalbeattie	11/E/2/0035	1 x 34.2m
05/04/2011	Crocketford Hs Crocketford	11/P/2/0134	2 x 27.1m	03/05/2011	Kirkland Farm K.patrick Dhm	11/E/2/0030	1 x 27m
04/04/2011	Auchengibbert Fm Crocketford	11/P/2/0133	3 x 27.1m	21/04/2011	Margrie Farm Borgue	11/E/2/0027	2 x 46.5m
04/04/2011	Croft Hd Farm Crocketford	11/P/2/0132	2 x 39.6m	06/04/2011	Cullinaw Farm Dalbeattie	11/E/2/0026	1 x 20m
04/04/2011	Chapel Farm Kirkcudbright	11/P/2/0131	1 x 39.6m	01/04/2011	Lochdougan Dairies, Kelton	11/E/2/0023	1 x 27.13m
25/03/2011	East Kirkcarsell Dundrennan	11/P/2/0117	3 x 19.6m	18/03/2011	West Barnoffity Kirkpatrick Dur	11/E/2/0021	2 x 21m
04/03/2011	Kirkmabreck Carluith	11/P/2/0084	1 x 45.9m	21/02/2011	Blairshinnock Fm Kirkgunzeon	11/E/2/0017	1 x 27m
03/03/2011	Blaiket Mains Haugh of Urr	11/P/2/0083	2 x 39m	22/02/2011	Cambret Hill Creetown	11/E/2/0016	1 x 45m
15/02/2011	Littleton Farm Gatehouse of Ft	11/P/2/0065	3 x 40m	21/02/2011	Trostrie Farm Twynholm	11/E/2/0015	1 x 66.6m
15/01/2011	Mayfield Farm Rhonehouse	11/P/2/0001	7 x 130m withdrawn	17/01/2011	Culnaightrie Auchencairn	11/E/2/0005	1 x 70m
22/12/2010	Ingleston Farm Twynholm	10/P/2/0491	2 x 45.5m	22/10/2010	Standingstone Fm, Borgue	10/E/2/0033	1 x 62m
21/12/2010	Culraven Farm Borgue	10/P/2/0490	2 x 45.5m	22/10/2010	Irelandton Farm Twynholm	10/E/2/0032	4 x 100m
20/12/2010	Craigmore Hill Lochfoot	10/P/2/0487	2 x 45.5m Rejected	01/07/2010	Glenquicken Moor, Creetown	10/E/2/0023	1 x 67m
04/11/2010	Loch Hill Nth of Dalry	10/P/2/0427	76m mast	24/06/2010	Rutherford's Wit Gatehouse of Ft	10/E/2/0021	2 x 45.5m
13/04/2010	Banks Hill Kirkcudbright	10/P/2/0144	1 x 45m	24/06/2010	Knockenbrex Moss Carrick	10/E/2/0019	2 x 45.5m
13/04/2010	Grange Hill Kirkcudbright	10/P/2/0143	1 x 45m	14/06/2010	Barclay Hill	10/E/2/0018	6 x 125m

Approved				Date	Location	Application No	No of turbines/ mast & height
Date	Location	Application No	No of turbines/ mast & height/				
				21/04/2010	Arvie, Castle Douglas	10/P/2/0158	1 x 20m
04/03/2011	Furmiston Crag Carsphairn	11/P/2/0088	80m mast	14/04/2010	Glensone Fm Southwick	10/P/2/0146	1 x 20m
04/03/2011	Quantans Hill Cairnsphairn	11/P/2/0087	80m mast	30/03/2010	Low Barend Fm Dundrenan	10/P/2/0122	1 x 20m
15/02/2011	Larg Farm Creetown	11/P/2/0063	1 x 27m	19/03/2010	Torrs Farm Castle Douglas	10/P/2/0102	1 x 20m
14/02/2011	Merklandwell Lochfoot	11/P/2/0060	1 x 27m	19/01/2010	Plascow Farm Dalbeattie	10/P/2/0018	50m mast
14/02/2011	Crochmore Fm Crocketford	11/P/2/0059	1 x 27m	19/01/2010	Balmangan Fm Borgue	10/P/2/0017	1 x 20m
27/01/2011	Portmary House Dundrennan	11/P/2/0041	1 x 22.4m	24/12/2009	Blairshinnock Fm Kirkgunzeon	09/P/2/0434	1 x 15m
23/12/2010	High Barcaple Fm Ringford	10/P/2/0498	1 x 21m	21/12/2009	Corse Hill Dunchrae Dalry	09/P/2/0429	Mast
22/12/2010	Auchenlock Fm Auchencairn	10/P/2/0496	1 x 27m	05/11/2009	Ardendee, Kirkcudbright	09/P/2/0373	Mast
22/12/2010	Barstilby Farm Tongland	10/P/2/0495	2 x 21m	08/09/2009	Portmary Cott Dundrennan	09/P/2/0311	1 x 15m
22/12/2010	Slaglaw Farm Kelton	10/P/2/0494	2 x 41m	28/08/2009	Durham Hill Kirkpatrick Dm	09/P/2/0300	1 x no height given
08/12/2010	Sypland Kirkcudbright	10/P/2/0474	2 x 20m	12/06/2009	Little Farm Gatehouse	09/P/2/0208	1 x no height given
25/11/2010	Drumhumphry Corsock	10/P/2/0455	2 x 15m hub	15/05/2009	Galtway Hill Milton Farm Kbt	09/P/2/0164	60m mast
09/11/2010	Ladies Walk Farm Kirkcudbright	10/P/2/0433	85m mast	16/02/2009	Glenquicken Fm Creetown	09/P/2/0049	2 x 15m
01/11/2010	Greenburn Creetown	10/P/2/0421	30m mast	07/07/2008	Magree Dalry	08/P/2/0289 08/P/2/0290	Mast x No ht Mast x No ht
11/08/2010	Larg Farm Creetown	10/P/2/0316	1 x 23.4m	17/01/2008	High Barley Fm Gatehouse	08/P/2/0011	Mast x no ht
26/07/2010	Boreland of Colvend Farm	10/P/2/0296	1 x 20m	18/12/2007	Mackilston Dalry	07/P/2/0518	1 x no height given
22/07/2010	Milnmark Farm Dalry	10/P/2/0291	1 x 20m	22/05/2007	Forest Estate Dalry	07/P/2/0223	1 x 15m
15/06/2010	Mark Farm Creetown	10/P/2/0247	60m mast	26/02/2007	Adj 93 Cottan St, Castle Doug	07/P/2/0084	1 x no height given
02/06/2010	Culnaightrie Fm Auchencairn	10/P/2/0238	1 x 20m	13/12/2005	Rainton Farm Gatehouse	05/P/2/0510	1 x 25m
25/05/2010	Milnthird Hill Kelton	10/P/2/0228	50m mast	23/08/2005	Windy Standard	05/P/2/0357	2 x 50m masts
07/05/2010	Barcloy Hill Kirkcudbright	10/P/2/0202	80m mast	17/06/2003	Edgerton Cothse Laurieston	03/P/2/0262	1 x no height given
28/04/2010	Boreland o Borg Kirkcudbright	10/P/2/0186	1 x 20m	10/06/2003	Torrs Hill Forest Estate Dalry	03/P/2/0252	2 x 100m 1 x mast no ht
				28/01/2003	Windy Standard	03/P/2/0022 03/P/2/0018	1 x 60m mast 1 x 60m mast